Quantum Dynamics Study of the $F + CH_4 \rightarrow HF + CH_3$ Reaction on an Ab Initio Potential Energy Surface

Dunyou Wang* 
College of Physics and Electronics, Shandong Normal University, 88 East Wenhua Road, Jinan 250014, People’s Republic of China

Gábor Czákó†
Laboratory of Molecular Structure and Dynamics, Institute of Chemistry, Eötvös University, H-1518 Budapest 112, P.O. Box 32, Hungary

Supporting Information

ABSTRACT: A quantum reactive dynamics, four degree-of-freedom, time-dependent wavepacket method is applied to study the $F + CH_4 \rightarrow HF + CH_3$ reaction using a slightly modified version of the ab initio potential energy surface of Czákó et al. [J. Chem. Phys. 2009, 130, 084301]. A common resonance peak is found on all initial state-selected reaction probabilities close to the reaction threshold. The resonance also survives the averaging of partial waves and shows up in the integral cross section just after the threshold energy, in agreement with experiment. This early-barrier polyatomic reaction is more enhanced by the translational motion than the vibrational motion for energies below 0.38 eV; however, the reverse is true for energies higher than 0.38 eV. The vibrational excitation of the CH stretching mode enhances the reactivity, whereas the excitation of the umbrella mode of CH$_4$ hinders the reactivity. The calculated thermal rate constants are in good agreement with one direct experimental measurement.

1. INTRODUCTION

A lot of attention has been paid to the $F + CH_4$ reaction as it serves as one of the prototypes to understand the driving force for polyatomic reaction dynamics. For the atom–diatom reactions, the Polanyi rules state that for an early saddle point in the entrance channel of the reaction, translational motion plays a more important role in the reactivity than the vibrational excitations, and for a late transition state in the product channel, the reverse is true. However, we are not sure whether these rules are still valid for the reaction systems with more than three atoms, especially when van der Waals (vdW) wells show up on the multidimensional potential energy surfaces (PESs), which make the scenario more complicated to distinguish which force drives the reaction. For example, the full-dimensional ab initio potential energy surface of the $F + CH_4$ reaction has an early saddle point located in the reactant channel, a van der Waals valley in the entrance channel, and an additional relatively deep vdW minimum in the product valley. The complex feature of this PES makes it difficult to predict which motion drives the reaction.

A more extreme case is the $H_3^+ + H_2$ reaction system because the potential energy surface has 10 stationary points, that is, 1 global minimum and nine saddle points (three in the reactant channel and the other six in the product channel). Therefore, it is even more difficult to tell if an early saddle point drives the reaction or a late barrier does. Indeed, the seven degree-of-freedom (7DOF) quantum reaction dynamics calculation for the isotopic reaction, $H_2D^+ + H_2 \rightarrow H_3D^+ + HD$, shows that the stretching motion of $H^+\cdot HD$ only has a small effect on the reaction probability; the vibrational excitation of HD in $H_2D^+$ hinders the reactivity. By contrast, rotational excitation of $H^+\cdot HD$ greatly enhances the reactivity by a factor of about 2–3 for high rotational states relative to the reactivity of the ground-state reaction. To our knowledge, this is the first time that we observed that the rotational excitations dominate the polyatomic reactivity not the vibrational and translational energy.

We know that excited polyatomic vibrational motions can have profound effects on the chemical reactivity; however, not all vibrational modes exert the same effects on reactivity. More interestingly, in 2007, Liu et al. found that the translational energy has a larger effect on the reactivity of the late-barrier $Cl + CHD_3$ reaction than the excitation of the reagent CH stretching mode, which contradicts the Polanyi rules. In 2012, a
6DOF quantum study on the Cl + CH₄ reaction showed that at very low scattering energies, the translational energy indeed drives the reaction more than the vibrational energy for this late-barrier reaction. Then, a 7DOF quantum dynamics study on Cl + CHD₃ showed that the Polanyi rules hold for the Cl + CHD₃ reaction, except at very low collision energies. Both quantum dynamics studies were carried out on the same accurate ab initio PES. This theoretical work inspired an experimental reinvestigation, which found that probing all of the rotational states of the CD₃(ν = 0) products bring theory and experiment into agreement. It is clear that the detailed dynamics of which energy forms drive the polyatomic reactions has not been well-understood, and both experimental and theoretical work need to be combined to understand the fundamental mechanism and rules of the polyatomic reactions.

The F + CH₄ reaction has been studied extensively both experimentally and theoretically because it plays an important role in atmospheric chemistry and has become a benchmark system to study polyatomic reactivity. Experimental studies by Liu and co-workers on the title reaction revealed resonance signatures near the reaction threshold. In addition, the resonances also appeared in the F + CHD₃ reaction, and the experimental study concluded that the resonances can survive the averaging over impact parameters and show up in the integral cross sections in favorable cases. Furthermore, another experiment on the CH stretching excitation in this early-barrier F + CHD₃ reaction showed that one quantum excitation of the CH stretch mode of CHD₃ slows down the reaction rate and favors the DF + CHD₂ products. This unexpected experimental finding was recently explained by quasiclassical trajectory (QCT) calculations showing that a long-range stereodynamical interaction induced by the CH stretching excitation steers the slow F atom to one of the CD bonds, thereby promoting the D-abstraction channel at low collision energies. The recent experimental study also by Liu et al. on F + CH₄ found that the antisymmetric stretch of CH₄ prohibits the CH bond rupture.

Several quantum reaction dynamics studies have been performed on the title reaction. Han et al. performed a 5DOF SVRT model calculation using two different PESs constructed based on the analytical form proposed by Jordan and Gilbert for the H + CH₄ reaction. Resonance was observed on one of the PESs near the threshold but disappeared for a partial wave J greater than 30. No rate coefficients were calculated from this study. A 3DOF time-independent calculation and a 5DOF SVRT study were carried out on the PES-2006 F + CH₄ surface developed by the Espinosa-Garcia group. In the 5DOF study, a single resonance peak was found in the reaction probabilities for J ≤ 55. Rate constants were also reported in the 5DOF study; the results showed that over the temperature range of 180–400 K, the 5DOF results underestimated and overestimated the experimental results at low and high temperatures by factors of 1.17 and 1.21, respectively. Clary and co-workers carried out a 2DOF quantum study on the isotopic reaction of F + CHD₃ to study the reactive resonance and cross sections.

In the present study, we carry out reduced-dimensional, 4DOF quantum reaction dynamics computations to study the title reaction on a modified ab initio full-dimensional PES. The purpose here is three-fold, (1) exploring the resonance features discovered in the experimental studies and theoretically investigating early barrier effects on the reaction dynamics, and (3) comparing our computed thermal rate constants with the available experimental results.

We perform our quantum reactive dynamics on the title reaction using an ab initio full-dimensional PES. This is the first quantum reaction dynamics calculation on this PES. The original PES, reported in ref 2, was based on 19384 high-quality ab initio energies describing the complex region FCH₄ (12384) and the fragment channels, F + CH₄ (2000), HF + CH₃ (2000), CH₂F + H₂ (2000), and CH₃F + H (1000), where the number of data points is given in parentheses. This PES has been used in a couple of QCT studies. The agreement between the computed and measured product distributions, for example, HF(ν,J) rovibrational populations, was impressive; however, the QCT results are sensitive to the binning technique. Furthermore, tunneling may also have a significant effect on the dynamics, especially at low collision energies, which adds to our motivation to carry out quantum dynamics computations for the title reaction. For the present quantum study, we have further improved the short-range and three-body regions of the PES in order to avoid any pathological behavior of the wave packet. We have added 1381 new data points to the original data set, (a) 1200 UCCSD(T)/aug-cc-pVTZ energy points corresponding to the CH₃ + F + H configurations and (b) 181 very high energy points in the short-range region, where both CH and HF distances are short. We obtained the analytical PES by a weighted linear least-squares fit to the combined 20765 energy points using a six-order polynomial basis of Morse-like variables that is explicitly invariant under the permutations of like atoms. The parameters used during the fit are the same as those in ref 2. All of the properties of the original and modified PESs are very similar, as shown in Table S1 of the Supporting Information, except that the revised PES has an improved short-range behavior and dissociates properly to CH₃ + H + F.

This paper is organized as follows. In section 2, we briefly describe the reduced-dimensional, 4DOF quantum reactive dynamics approach for this reaction system. Section 3 presents the initial state-selected reaction probabilities, integral cross sections, cumulative reaction probability, and rate coefficients, as well as the explanation and discussion of the computed results. Conclusions are given in section 4.

2. THEORETICAL METHODS

A. 4DOF Approach. In this 4DOF quantum dynamics approach, we treat this reaction as an atom–triatom system, F + HCX, as shown in Figure 1, where three H atoms are treated as one pseudatom, X, with its mass located at the center of mass of the three nonreactive H atoms. Thus, the 4DOF includes the CX vibrational motion (r), which approximately represents the umbrella motion of CH₃ with CH bond lengths fixed at the saddle point values, the bond-breaking motion (ρ), and the translational motion (R); because at the reaction saddle point the C–H–F is not linear, but slightly bent, we also consider one bending motion (as shown by the γ DOF in Figure 1). Thus, the interaction potential for this 4DOF approach only has four variables, R, ρ, r, and γ, while θ and φ are fixed at the transition-state geometry.

The 4DOF Hamiltonian in reactant Jacobi coordinates, as shown in Figure 1, can be written as
The distance between the center of mass of CHX and the F atom.

reaction probabilities with respect to dirovibrational eigenfunctions de

been chosen to expand the wave function in the interaction region. We used 40 potential-optimized vibrational DVR points for the r coordinate in the range of 0.7–6.5 bohr, 10 potential-optimized vibrational DVR points for CX covering the range of 0.0–2.1 bohr, and 50 spherical harmonic rotational functions for ρ. The time-dependent wavepacket was propagated with a time step of 15 au. The above numerical parameters were sufficient to get the initial-state-selected reaction probabilities converged for the current 4DOF reduced-dimensional dynamics study.

B. Vibrational States of CH4. Initial vibrational states of the reactant CH4 were obtained by solving the following 2DOF vibrational Schrödinger equation of the pseudotriatom HCX

where νρ and νr represent the vibrational quantum numbers of the stretching vibrations of ρ and r (as seen in Figure 1), respectively. \( \hat{H}_\text{HCX} \) is defined as

where \( h(\rho) \) and \( h(r) \) were given in eq 2 and \( V_{\text{2D}}(\rho, r) \) is the 2DOF potential energy surface at the reactant asymptotic region.

The vibrational levels (\( \nu_{\rho}, \nu_r \)) of HCX assigned to their corresponding vibrational excitation states are listed in Table 1.

C. Initial-State-Selected Reaction Probabilities. Figure 2 shows the initial-state-selected reaction probabilities for total angular momentum \( J = 0 \) for the first eight vibrational initial states of CH4(\( \nu_{\rho}, \nu_r \)) as a function of translational energy. First, we notice that the reaction probabilities rise very rapidly as the translational energy increases. For example, as seen for the ground-state reaction probability, the reaction probability rapidly increases about 20 fold from 0.01 to about 0.2 as the translational energy increases from 0.01 to 0.2 eV. The increase reaches to ~26 fold at 0.38 eV. Thus, the translational energy greatly enhances the reactivities for translational energy less than 0.38 eV. However, the reaction probability stays almost constant after 0.38 eV for the ground state, which means that
the translation energy does not have a significant effect on the reactivity for energies greater than 0.38 eV.

As the vibrational quantum numbers increase, the C−X(r) vibration does not enhance the reaction probability; instead, it hinders the reactivity as the (0,1), (0,2), (0,3), and (0,4) reaction probabilities are all lower than the ground-state reaction probability. Nonetheless, the stretching motion of C−H(ρ) enhances the reaction probability as the (1,0) reaction probability is greater than that of the ground state. However, the average increase of the reaction probability from (0,0) to (1,0) is only about a factor of 1.3. On the basis of the above results, we can conclude that the translational energy is more effective on the reactivity below 0.38 eV than the vibrational energy for this polyatomic reaction. However, the vibrational energy is more effective on the reactivity than the translational energies higher than 0.38 eV.

Second, this potential energy surface has a very small barrier of around ∼0.02 eV (the best ab initio prediction including spin−orbit effects is 0.03 eV). Because the reaction probability shows up below 0.02 eV, for example, for the (1,0) state, the reaction probability even reaches about 0.1 at 0.02 eV, the tunneling effect seems to be prominent for this reaction. This is expected because a light atom (H) is abstracted from HCX to form HF with the F atom.

Third, all of the vibrational-mode-selective reaction probability curves show resonance peaks. Furthermore, all of the resonance peaks appear at around 0.04 eV just after the reaction threshold. The resonance feature showing up close to the reaction threshold was observed in the F + CH4 experiment by Liu et al.17,18 In general, on the basis of the vibrational-state-selective reaction probabilities, we can conclude that with an early barrier in the reactant channel, the translational energy greatly enhances the reactivity for translational energy below 0.38 eV; however, it has less effect than the vibrational energy at higher energies. In addition, the C−H stretching motion only slightly affects the reaction, whereas the umbrella motion hinders the reactivity. Furthermore, all of the reaction probabilities show a common resonance peak just after the threshold energy at around 0.04 eV, which confirms the experimental finding of resonance in this reaction.

D. Integral Cross Section. In order to calculate the integral cross section, all reaction probabilities for different partial waves up to J = 135 are calculated to converge the translational energy up to 0.7 eV. Figure 3 shows the plot of the reaction probability for seven different partial waves, J = 0, 20, 40, 60, 80, 100, and 120. Note that the common resonance peak after the threshold, found in the J = 0 computations, shows up in every partial wave (J > 0) reaction probability. Using eq 3, the integral cross section for the ground-state reaction is plotted in Figure 4. Because each H atom in CH4 should have an equal opportunity to react, the integral cross section is multiplied by a factor of 4 for the ground vibrational state before plotted in Figure 4. In

Table 1. Initial Vibrational States, (νρ,νr), of CHX(H3) a

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>state no.</th>
<th>(νρ,νr)</th>
<th>E (cm⁻¹)</th>
<th>E (cm⁻¹)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(0,0)</td>
<td>2254</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>(0,1)</td>
<td>3680</td>
<td>1425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>(0,2)</td>
<td>5105</td>
<td>2851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>(1,0)</td>
<td>5235</td>
<td>2981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>(0,3)</td>
<td>6551</td>
<td>4297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>(1,1)</td>
<td>6645</td>
<td>4390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>(0,4)</td>
<td>8033</td>
<td>5779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>(1,2)</td>
<td>8083</td>
<td>5829</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>(2,0)</td>
<td>8104</td>
<td>5850</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

aThe energy levels Eρ and E are relative to the FCH₄ asymptotic region and the ground vibrational state, respectively.
Figure 4, we also compare our ground-state integral cross sections, obtained by summing over all of the product states, with the most recent measurement of the excitation functions by Liu et al.28 Because the experiment did not report absolute cross sections, we rescaled the computed excitation function by a factor of 3.06 in order to help the comparison between the measured and computed data. Both the calculated and measured excitation functions have a steep rise after the threshold, but the experimental excitation function peaks at around 2.6 kcal/mol, whereas the computed peak occurs at about 5.1 kcal/mol. Furthermore, the decrease in the measured cross section after the peak is much steeper than that in the calculations. The above differences may be explained as follows. First, and perhaps most importantly, the measured excitation function, $\sigma_0(0_0)$ in Figure 8 of ref 34 corresponds to the $F + CH_4(\nu = 0) \rightarrow HF + CH_3(\nu = 0)$ reaction. The $\sigma_0(1_1)$ cross sections, which are also measured and correspond to the ground-state reactant and the symmetric-stretch excited product $CH_4(\nu_1 = 1)$ are virtually negligible. However, the umbrella-excited $CH_3(\nu_2 = 1, 2, \ldots)$ products are not reported in ref 34, which may also have significant populations, especially at higher collision energies; thus, $\sigma_0(0_0)$ underestimates the total cross sections and shows a faster decay as the collision energy increases. Second, in the present model, there are no internal rotational motions included for $CH_4$ except the external rotational motion of the $F$ atom with respect to the $CH_4$ center of mass rotation. As a result, during the collision process, the vibrational energy of $CH_4$ cannot be efficiently transferred to the rotational motions and to the other neglected vibrational DOFs, which makes the CH vibration more active than that in reality (experiment); thus, theory shows a later peak and slower decay of the cross sections after the position of the peak. Third, experiment may underestimate the cross sections at higher collision energies because experiment only probes the low-$N$ states of the $CH_4$ products, which warrants caution when comparing theory and experiment, as was shown recently for the $Cl + CH_3$ reaction.8

Figure 4 also shows that even after the averaging over the different partial waves, a prominent resonance peak still appears at 0.038 eV, which is just after the reaction threshold. This confirms the experimental finding of Liu et al.18,19 that the resonances can survive the averaging over impact parameters and show up in the integral cross sections.

There is also another measurement on the absolute integral cross sections by Aquilanti et al.21 for the title reaction. However, the experiment did not sample the regions of the PES directly leading to reaction because the measured integral cross sections were mostly dominated by large impact parameters. Another issue why we cannot compare this experiment to the present state-specific 4DOF results is that the cross sections were measured for the sum of all of the reactant and product states.

We notice that the 2DOF $F + CH_4$ study by Han et al.27 based on the two semiempirical PESs, found the resonance close to the threshold on one of the PESs, but the resonance feature disappeared for partial waves $J > 30$, and the two integral cross sections on the two PESs had totally different shapes, and only one of them showed a very broad resonance feature at around 0.06 eV. On their second 2DOF study on the semiempirical PES-2006,29 a single resonance peak was found in the reaction probabilities for $J \leq 55$. They did not find a resonance peak on the ground-state integral cross section but found a resonance peak at 0.015 eV, for the integral cross section of the first excited umbrella motion. The 3DOF study by Nyman et al.28 also on the PES-2006 shows resonance features, one at $\sim 0.06$ eV and another at $\sim 0.13$ eV on the ground-state integral cross section. Note that all of the integral cross sections from the above three dynamics calculations show a gradual increase as the energy increases. This is different from the present ground-state integral cross section. Our integral cross section shows a rapid increase from 0.01 to 0.2 eV, and then, it decreases as the energy increases. This behavior is also found in the experimental cross section by Liu et al.18,34 that is, the integral cross section rapidly increases from the threshold to reach a maximum at $\sim 0.1$ eV and then decreases as the energy increases. However, as mentioned earlier, the experimental integral cross section is specific for the $CH_3(\nu = 0)$ product state, whereas our calculation gives the total integral cross section involving all of the product states. Thus, we cannot directly compare our results with experiment. The current study shows that the resonance peak appears in every partial wave reaction probability; this is different from the previous calculations too. We think that the major differences on the integral cross section and partial waves in the above quantum dynamics calculations are mainly due to the characters and accuracies of the different PESs used in these dynamics studies.

**E. Cumulative Reaction Probability and Rate Constant.** The 4DOF cumulative reaction probability is obtained by summing over all of the rovibrational states of $CH_4$. In order to converge the translational energy up to 0.5 eV, rotational states up to a maximum $j$ of 10, 7, 4, and 3 are computed for the $(0,0)$, $(0,1)$, $(0,2)$, and $(1,0)$ vibrational states, respectively. In Figure 5, the reaction probabilities for the reactant ground and first four rotational excitation states are shown. By summing over all of the rovibrational states of $CH_4$, the 4DOF reduced-dimensional cumulative reaction probability is obtained, as shown in Figure 6.

In eq 5, the rotational constant to calculate the reactant rotational partition function is $5.27$ cm$^{-1}$. At the bent transition state, $F−CH_4$ is an asymmetric top, and the three rotational constants are $5.44, 0.27$, and $0.26$ cm$^{-1}$ for the $Q_{rot}$ calculation. For the reactant vibrational partition function, the harmonic vibrational frequencies are used. There are eight vibrational frequencies “missing” from our 4DOF reduced-dimensional calculation at the transition state, which are 40, 1335, 1361, 1520, 1539, 3070, 3185, and 3203 cm$^{-1}$. They are used to
compute the vibrational partition function at the transition state, \( Q_v(T) \).

In Figure 7, we compare our theoretical results with two experimental \( k(T) \) for the F + CH₄ reaction. Until today, there have been three experimental reports that directly determined the rate constants as a function of temperature.20,37,46 However, only Persky’s20 (from 184 to 406 K) and Wagner’s37 results (from 253 to 352 K) have a linear dependency on the temperature, and the \( k(T) \) from Moore et al.46 exhibits a very unusual temperature dependence. Therefore, here, only Persky’s and Wagner’s results have been plotted against our computed ones from 184 to 406 K in Figure 7. Note that the two measurements show quite different slopes of the rate curves. Nonetheless, our theoretical results on the present ab initio PES, in general, agree well with Persky’s results, and at the lower- and higher-temperature ends, our results are slightly bigger than Persky’s results.

4. CONCLUSIONS

We have carried out reduced-dimensional quantum reaction dynamics, time-dependent wavepacket propagation computations to study the F + CH₄\((v_j)\) \(\rightarrow\) HF + CH₃ reaction. A four degree-of-freedom approach is employed to study the initial-state-selective reaction probabilities, reactive resonances, and rate constants on the slightly modified version of the full-dimensional ab-initio-based PES reported in ref 2.

The initial-state-selected reaction probability is reported in this paper for total angular momentum \( J = 0 \). We observe a common resonance peak showing up on the reaction probabilities near the reaction threshold for all of the vibrational states. Our study shows that the vibrational excitation of C–H has less effect on the reactivity than translational energy, and the vibrational umbrella motion of C–H₃ hinders the reactivity. The calculations also show that the translational energy enhances the reactivity more than the vibrational energy for energies less than 0.38 eV, and the reverse is true for energies higher than 0.38 eV. The resonance feature shows up in the initial-state-selected reaction probabilities and also appears on the integral cross section spectrum. This confirms the experimental detection of the resonance feature of this reaction.17,18 The comparison of the rate constants between our theoretical calculations and direct experiment measurements shows that our results agree with Persky’s results well.

In addition, the current study indicates that for polyatomic reactions, due to the complexity of the PES, it is difficult to predict which driving force is the more effective one to activate the reaction. Nevertheless, we hope that more and more research on polyatomic reactions will uncover the fundamental rules of complex chemical processes.

ASSOCIATED CONTENT

Supporting Information
Properties (structures and relative energies of the stationary points) of the modified version of the full-dimensional ab initio potential energy surface. This material is available free of charge via the Internet at http://pubs.acs.org.

AUTHOR INFORMATION

Corresponding Author
*E-mail: dywang@sdu.edu.cn.
Notes
The authors declare no competing financial interest.
†E-mail: czako@chem.elte.hu

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors thank Dr. Kopin Liu for sending the experimental excitation function. D.Y.W. thanks the Tanshan Scholarship Funds of Shandong Province and the National Science Funding of China (Grant No. 10944006) for supporting this work. G.C. would like to acknowledge the Scientific Research Fund of Hungary (OTKA, NK83583) and the Magyary Fellowship of the European Union and Hungary (TÁMOP 4.2.4.A/1-11-1-2012-0001) for financial support.

REFERENCES